# ASSESSING LIABILITY WITH ARGUMENTATION MAPS: AN APPLICATION IN AVIATION LAW

G. Contissa, M. Laukyte, G. Sartor, H. Schebesta

JURIX 2013 December 13, Bologna

## CONTEXT: AIR TRAFFIC MANAGEMENT



## **CONTEXT: SUPER AUTOMATED HIGH-TECH**



## **CONTEXT: MANY STAKEHOLDERS**







2 m.

#### Addressing the Liability Impact

#### of Automated Systems

#### Home

#### **The Project**

ALIAS is a challenging and innovative project focusing on the legal implication of automation in complex socio-technical systems. It looks at liability attribution as an emerging fundamental issue of human-technology interaction to be taken into account in highly automated environments. The project is co-financed by EUROCONTROLacting on behalf of the SESAR Joint Undertaking with funds from the EUROPEAN UNION as part of Work Package E.

Objectives	
objectives	
Sesar WPE	٥
Consortium	۲
Worknlan	

### Our Resources C ...

S. 😨 🛗 🖬 🎔

New user?

#### Latest news



# ALIAS project: THE LEGAL CASE

So as to address this problem at the early stage of design, we have developed The Legal Case methodology.

### 4 steps:

- 1. Understand the concept
- 2. Identify the liability issues
- 3. Perform the legal analysis
- 4.Collect findings and produce results

## Why THE LEGAL CASE is at JURIX 2013?

### The Legal Case:

**1.maps and classifies** possible failures and damages caused by an automated technology;

- **2.links** failures to hypotheses of liability, so as to suggest at least one hypothesis of liability;
- **3.analyses** the legal rules and arguments supporting the attribution of liability for each of the hypotheses.

# How does the Legal Case do this?

- Map methodology: A novel way to represent legal issues, including:
  - Classification maps
    - Failures maps
    - Damages maps
    - Legal Risks maps
  - Argumentation maps
    - Legal Analysis maps
    - Legal Design maps
    - Insurance maps

Maps are representation, connection, comunication and assessment tools

## STEP 1 (Understand the concept): Failures maps



# Step 2 (Identify the Liability Issues): Legal Risks and Legal Analysis Maps

- Liability risks associated with possible failures are identified though risk-liability and damage-liability maps;
- Liability risks are assessed though legalanalysis maps, according to existing laws and contractual arrangements.

# Step 2: Legal Risk Maps



## STEP 2: Legal Analysis Map on product liability





# Step 3 (perform the legal analysis): Legal Design Maps

**Legal Design measures** are proposals on possible mitigation and recommendations for the design of a system and can take form of private (contractual) legal agreements, which can be:

- 1. Liability mitigating
- 2. Liability enhancing
- 3. Liability displacing

Maps are used here to design and validate these measures so as to find the best way to allocate liabilities among the stakeholders.

### **Step 3: Legal Design Map on Software Liability**



Bright Future Ahead • Link the maps to source materials

Cover more legal topics

• Make maps more interactive (online)

 Enable the users to change maps and add new arguments, personal notes, ... (Carneades, OVA)

 Introduce automatic assessment of argument status

## THANK YOU FOR YOUR ATTENTION.

### **ANY QUESTIONS?**

MORE ABOUT ALIAS PROJECT AT WWW.ALIASNETWORK.EU

